Nanzan University

Cinderella in Tibet
Author(s): Wayne Schlepp
Source: *Asian Folklore Studies*, Vol. 61, No. 1 (2002), pp. 123-147
Published by: Nanzan University
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/1178680
Accessed: 05/08/2013 08:31

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Nanzan University is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Asian Folklore Studies.*

http://www.jstor.org

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

WAYNE SCHLEPP
University of Toronto

Cinderella in Tibet

Abstract

A story in chapter 11 of the *Vetalapañcavimsati* contains the elements of some widely occurring folktales. This story, preserved in Tibetan literature, could be quite old and closely related to the origins of all Cinderella-type stories. It is a well-formed didactic tale with sound etiological grounding; and it is reasonable to assume that, as it migrated from one community to another and encountered different moral systems, certain events, having lost the social context that gave them meaning, became random elements dictated by a nameless fate. In this regard it is interesting to note how other versions elsewhere lack, by comparison, moral or logical justification from the prevailing "real world" of the community in which they circulate and become to a certain degree deformed, as Cosquin would say. Given the state of the evidence, however, it is difficult to argue that the Tibetan story is in fact a key member in the development of Cinderella stories; but even if it is not, we can still say that the wider context this version brings to speculations upon the stories and their elements is of benefit to research on the Cinderella cycle.

Keywords: Cinderella—Tibet—*Vetalapañcavimsati*—reincarnation—Mongolia—folk tales—popular literature—magic corpse—Grimm—Perrault—matricide

Asian Folklore Studies, Volume 61, 2002: 123–147

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

THE *VETALAPAÑCAVIMSATI,* or *The Twenty-five Stories of the Magic Corpse,* is a repository of tales common to folk traditions among the peoples of Central Asia. In certain versions of this collection the eleventh story has characteristics of folktales that are well known in the West. Although the manuscripts and editions are many and various, two will serve our purposes: one is a transcription and translation from Tibetan by A. W. Macdonald and the other a Tibetan text with facing Mongolian translation edited by Damdinsürüng.[1] In each of them the story that concerns us is almost identical in form, though there are some differences in wording and other details.[2]

The stories in this collection are didactic and were likely meant for the edification of the layman. They are brought together within a frame story in which Prince Bde-spyod bzang-po (Mongolian: Sayin amuγulang yabutaltu qaγan), through a chain of circumstances, becomes a disciple of Nagarjuna, founder of the Madhyamika school of Buddhism, and is set the task of obtaining a magic corpse which, it is alleged, will bring about the salvation of the world. In order to do this, the prince must observe strict proscriptions, one of which is not to utter a single word as he carries the corpse away from the cemetery. The corpse is at pains to escape and so tells marvelous stories, the endings of which invariably bring a remark of surprise or admiration from the prince whereupon the corpse breaks his bonds and flies away. In this way the stories are accumulated, thirteen in the basic collection, more in others.

CHAPTER ELEVEN OF THE *SIDDITÜ KEGÜR*:[3]

Title:

The chapter wherein it is presented that although the ogres, mother and daughter, turned the head of a human girl, in the end the girl's mother, who was indeed a wise goddess, repaid the evil that was done and made it possible for her daughter to become queen.

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Frame story:

001
Again the prince went back to the cemetery. [As before] he said, "My master is Nakazun-a Jirüken; I am the King of the Good and Peaceful Deeds; my net is of nine-fold-twisted steel; my staff is of purple sandalwood; my rope is a fine chain; my knife has a blade that cuts stone; and my provender is inexhaustible. Corpse! Are you coming down or not? I shall cut down your tree." The corpse came down whereupon [the prince] hit him with his staff, put him in his net and hoisted him on his back with his rope. He had walked only ten steps when [the corpse] said, "Prince, Prince! You tell a story, otherwise I will tell a story [for you] to hear." "I know what he is up to," the prince thought and said not a word, so [the corpse said], "Since you won't say anything, Prince, you listen."

Section I:

016
In early times at the lower end of a valley lived a great king. In the upper valley lived a woman and her daughter and in their village there lived an ogress with her daughter. One day when the human girl went to the house of the ogress to ask for fire, the ogress and her daughter gave the girl a small piece of a human ear which they had roasted. The girl said, "It tastes very good!"[4] "Come and be our friend," they said. "Even though I want to, my mother will not let me." "If you kill your mother you could come," they said and the girl asked, "How do I kill her?" The ogress instructed her as follows: "Say that you are ill and she will surely ask, 'What is there to cure your illness?' Then you say, 'There is a way to cure my illness but you will never do it.' And when she says, 'If there is a way, no matter what it is, I will do it,' you must say, 'Then you let me hold the millstone and if you beat it with your breasts,[5] that will help me.' She will say, 'If it helps you, my daughter, no matter what it is, I will do it. Let me beat the stone.' And when she says that, hit her with the stone and kill her." The girl did as the ogress had instructed and when her mother was beating the stone she hacked at [her mother's] breasts with the stone and her mother, her breasts severed, died.

043
The girl said to the ogress and her daughter, "Come quick! I have killed my mother." They both came over. The ogress and her daughter ate the meat and gnawed the bones; the last bits were eaten up by the ogress herself. They gave the girl some tasteless gruel and made her gather firewood and herd the cows. The daughter of the ogress put on the girl's nice boots and clothes and

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

the girl had to wear the old, worn out boots and clothes of the ogress.

Section II:

051

The girl suffered and had to work very hard every day carrying wood and tending the cows, but very soon afterward, her mother was born as a cow of the ogress [to be] where the girl was. All the milk that was taken from that cow turned into cream; all that was churned became butter; that was the kind of cow she was.

After several days the cow said to the girl, "You who have cast away good fortune and bought misery, spread out your apron and go to sleep." The girl spread out her apron and slept until it was evening. She rose quickly and when she looked around, all her wool had been spun; a load of firewood had been gathered, and on her apron was set a large meal. All the cattle were lying quietly having eaten so that their stomachs were bulging more than ever before. After a time had passed and [the girl] had enjoyed this for a few days, the ogress said, "I give meat and butter and sugar to my own daughter; to you I give mixed gruel and you look healthy and fat; why is this?" The girl thought, "If I don't tell her the truth, she will surely kill me." And so she told her, "When our red cow said 'You who have bartered good fortune for misery, spread out your apron and go to sleep,' I spread my apron and then there was a meal prepared, the wool was spun by itself, the firewood gathered, the cows were full to bulging, and I dined. In that way I was satisfied." "Why didn't you say anything sooner? Tomorrow I will send my daughter out. I hardly realized that beggar woman had such powers. Now you stay here; I will send out your elder sister [i.e., my daughter]."

085

The next day when the daughter of the ogress went out to tend the cows, [the cow said,] "O daughter, who has bartered good fortune for misery, hold out your apron and go to sleep." The girl lay down and slept but when she arose, in the middle of the apron was [a heap of] cow manure, the wool was all hanging from the tops of the trees, the cows were scattered throughout the valley and so the girl, much distressed by her work, returned very late. "Daughter, why so late?" the ogre mother complained. The [ogre] daughter said to her mother, "When the cow said, 'Daughter who has bartered good fortune for misery, hold out your apron and go to sleep,' I held out my apron, as she said, and went to sleep. On the apron she produced a large [heap] of fresh dung, and tangled the wool in the tops of the trees, the cows were all scattered throughout the valley and so I was very busy and arrived late." "That bad, beggar woman mother, has turned [herself] into this cow; we will kill her."

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

101
When the girl went out again the next time, the cow instructed her, "You who have rejected good fortune and bought misery, O Daughter, today those two are going to kill me; after the killing is done, you must say, 'I need some parts of my dead mother's flesh; will you give me the four hooves?' Ask for the skin of the four legs and some parts of the intestines. Next use any means to beg the ogre mother for some bits of flesh and whatever she gives you, wrap it in the skin and bury it beneath the door sill."

112
The ogress killed the cow and said, "Girl, what parts of your mother's flesh do you need?" And the girl asked as she had been instructed, wrapped the flesh she was given in the skin and, without being seen, buried it under the door sill.

Section III:

117
After a while it was time for the great fair at the lower end of the valley. The ogress and her daughter both dressed up and put on their jewelry. The mother set out a full pot of barley and a full pot of mustard seeds; she mixed them together and said, "Girl, if you don't finish pounding this today, prepare for your death." The two of them left.[6]

123
Suddenly a dove[7] appeared and said, "Girl, who has exchanged good fortune for misery, take out what you buried under the door sill and put on your robe and boots, fasten your belt, adorn yourself with gold and jade and go to the fair." When the girl took out those things, she saw that the skin had become clothing and two of the hooves had become boots,[8] the intestines had become a belt and the other bits of flesh had become gold and jade. She put on the robe and boots and fastened the belt. The other two hooves had become a pair of slippers. These she took and after she had adorned herself with the gold and jade, she went to where the dove was and said, "The clothes and jewelry are very fine but if I do not finish grinding the pot of mustard seeds and the pot of barley, [they] will kill me tonight when they come back." "The mustard seeds and barley I will grind; you go to the fair, only come back a bit early," said [the dove].

139
The girl went to the fair; she circled the crowd to the right and saw that those two were there begging for something to eat. She then circled against the

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

[direction of the] sun and there saw a great prince who was most handsome of all. She enjoyed herself very much looking at all the things at the fair. Before the crowd dispersed, she hurried home but on the way back she lost one of her slippers while jumping across a stream. When she got home she hid away all her clothes and jewelry. Both the mustard seeds and barley had been ground.

150

When the prince's horse keeper went out to water the horses, the bay horse[9] did not drink but instead wandered upstream and the keeper followed after it. The horse sniffed out a beautiful slipper, which the keeper picked up, and when the horses were watered, he led them back and gave the slipper to the prince and reported the matter. The prince said, "Yesterday among the crowd was a girl about fifteen years old who had all the signs and marks of a goddess. If she comes again today, since I have found her through [the good offices of] this fine horse, I shall make her my queen and take her into the palace."

163

When the ogress and her daughter returned, the girl asked, "Did mother and elder sister enjoy themselves when they went to the fair? Who was the most outstanding man? Who was the most outstanding woman?" "The prince stood out above all the men and my daughter stood out above all the women. Have you finished grinding the mustard seeds and barley?" said [the ogress]. "I have finished grinding [the whole] bucket full."[10] "You are very good. It is all right for you to stay here." The ogre daughter said [then], "We saw a young person going about who resembled you and was beautifully dressed and adorned; I said to my mother that it must be you, but she said that was absolutely impossible, and she was right."

176

So they went to bed and when they arose the sun was up and they once again mixed a pot full of mustard seed and barley and said, "Grind this without delay," and the mother and daughter [ogres] went off to the fair. Then in a short while a flock of doves arrived and one among them said to the girl, "O Girl, put on your finery of yesterday and take your slipper and go. You will be able to escape the clutches of the ogress." The girl put on her finery, took the slipper in her hand and when she arrived at the gathering a minister of the king held up the slipper [which they had found previously] and said, "Whoever this fits, she will become the wife of the king." But there appeared to be no girl whom the slipper fit. The daughter of the ogress tried her right foot but it did not fit; she tried her left foot and it did not fit; even the tip of

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

her toe did not fit into the slipper. Then finally when no other person whom [the slipper] fit came forth, the girl took off her two boots, slung them onto her shoulder and went up saying, "That slipper is mine. Here is the other one," and she put the two slippers on one after the other. The ogress and her daughter, who were there, saw this and the daughter said, "That girl is the one." And the mother said, "How has she come to have such good fortune?" The girl became the wife of the king.

203

The ogress and her daughter returned home and there were bird tracks all over the house inside. The seeds and grains were broken open and eaten and the pots were filled with bird droppings. The ogress said, "That woman [i.e., girl's mother] planned to have it this way and this is what has happened. She is surely a female devil reborn as a dove."

Section IV:

210

After [the girl] became queen, she gave birth to a boy whom they called Jalaγu Ardasidi.[11] From the time the girl arrived, there was complete happiness in the land.

After a while the daughter of the ogress arrived saying, "I am visiting my friend." "Let her in," it was ordered, and she was allowed to come in. The queen thought, "When one has power, one must not be haughty," and she had her eat the same food as her own and had her wear the same clothes as her own. A little while later the ogre daughter began to ask questions to deceive [the girl], saying, "Sister! Ah, what do you give to the king? And what do you give to the courtiers?" "Ah, I give the king gruel and the courtiers I honor with the best of the three flavors." "What do you give to the bay horse? What do you give to the dogs Ngang-dkar and Dungchung?"[12] "To the bay horse I give bones, to Ngang-dkar and Dungchung I give horse feed." The ogre daughter then said, "How do you look after your son Ardasidi? And how do you look at the subjects?" "My son Ardasidi I slap once when I go up to him and once when I go away from him. The subjects I look at with a flick of the eye when I go up to them and when I leave them I give them a sidelong glance." "How do you go out the door and down the steps?" "I slam the door and tromp loudly down the steps." "What do you put into the fire?" "I put a solid ball of thread into the fire."[13]

240

After a while the ogre daughter said, "O Elder [Sister], it would be good if you washed your hair. Let me help you do it. In order to be a queen, you

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

must be well washed. Let me undo your braids." The queen reluctantly agreed and she prepared to wash her head with some water. "Because you are a queen, you should go to the lake [to wash]," said [the ogre daughter] and pulled her along. When they arrived at the side of the lake, [the queen] took off her jewelry and robes and wearing only her shift she bent her head down to wash her hair when the ogre daughter pushed her into the lake. She put on the queen's clothing and jewelry and went back [to the palace].

250

She made a display of being like the former queen, each time she opened and closed the door she slammed it until it broke, and when she climbed the stairs she stomped [as if to] break them. Whenever she approached or left Ardasidi she would each time give him a slap. She always gave a thin watery soup to the king and the good and nourishing food to the courtiers. To Ngang dkar and Dungchung, the dogs, she gave horse feed and always gave bones to the bay horse. To friends who came from nearby, she was unpleasant and rude; at others, who were from farther away, she looked askance in disdain. She put a solid knot of thread in the embers and so everyday she had to go out to beg someone for fire. The servants began to say amongst themselves: "Ever since the ogre daughter left, the queen's behavior has been odd; her speech and her nature have all changed; can we ever see [our previous] happiness again?"

270

After a while when the horse herder went to water the bay horse at the usual spring, it did not drink from this place, but struggled to escape toward the lake which it had seen before, drank a bit, and, as its tears were dropping profusely, out of the middle of the lake came a golden lark with turquoise feathers on its head and settled in a tree by the water's edge. It spoke thus: "Ah, is the former queen's respect for the king greater or is the respect of the latter queen greater? Is the care given before to the child Ardasidi greater or the care given later? Is the former queen more solicitous of the subjects or is the latter queen more solicitous? Did the former queen take better care of the dogs Ngang dkar and Dungchung or does the latter queen take better care of them? Did the former owner treat the bay horse better or does the present owner treat him better?" Saying this it went back into the water.

289

The horse herder watered the horses, then hurried back and reported to the king, "Our bay horse did not drink from the spring but broke away and went toward the lake, and when it drank, it whinnied and shed tears, and a golden lark with a turquoise head appeared, settled on a tree by the lake, and spoke

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

in the following fashion," and he reported carefully all that was said before. The king said, "Tomorrow I shall go to see. My dreams have indeed been bad. The nature of this girl [my wife] has indeed changed."

299

The next day the king, the prime minister, and the horse herder went to the edge of the lake. The bird, as described [by the herdsman], came out [of the water] and settled on the top of a tree and spoke the same words it had spoken before. The king wept and said, "Please come over here and speak to me; I will listen carefully." The bird landed on the head of the king and [the king] said, "Bird, please come to my hand and speak." When [the bird, resting] on his hand, had spoken as before, the king seized it.

309

The bird said, "The daughter of mine has committed a great wrong.[14] Let me, this bird, go," and repeated this several times. The king said, "Is there no way? Tell me one. Is there no gift one could prepare? Tell me one. What kind of a disaster has befallen you?" The bird said to the king, "The one who is now in your house is the daughter of an ogress. Through the unpaid debt of a previous life, I was as if lost in darkness and ignorance. That girl lead me to the lake side and pushed me in." She continued, "Now there is possibly a good plan. King, Minister, please do not say that I am here. [Take me] from this place and go to the palace, wrap me in a five colored scarf and put me in the treasure house. Have all the nobles gather to perform the Buyan Keseg and perform the Nasun-u bötügel rites for seven days.[15] Build a very large fire saying you are going to make wine; under the place where the daughter of the ogress sits dig a hole large enough to contain her body, next make the sides of it smooth and cover the opening. On top of it put the girl's mat; when she sits on it she will fall head-over-heels into the hole. When this happens, dump in the fire that has been prepared on top of her and she will die. After this, I will be restored to life."

333

The king and the minister happily prepared all as the girl had told them. As soon as the daughter of the ogress sat on her place, she fell head first [into the hole]. They put the fire in on top of her and she was burned to death. When they went into the treasure house, the other girl was alive again, her beautiful face unmarred as before. The queen [i.e., the girl] came forth and told the subjects, "Cut off the head of the ogre daughter." This she wrapped in a ball of thread as big as a cooking pot. She filled a container full of good things to eat, tied the two to the back of the saddle of the bay horse and she set off for the house of the ogress. She came to her as her own daughter and

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

nicely offered the good food to "her mother" saying, "Have you been well here all alone?" "I have been fine alone. Were you able to trick the queen? The king probably does not know. Were you able to be just like the girl?" Then the girl went upstairs and through a hole in the window let out a length of red silk. She went down again and said, "The king will scold me. Mother, help me to untangle this ball of thread. I must go now." The ogress said, "Farewell! Don't be discovered by the king. Cooperate with the subjects and take care of the child in exactly the same way that girl did." Then with the old woman holding the ball, the girl left taking one end of the thread. When it was nearly run out, she got onto her horse and dashed off pell-mell. When the thread ran out, from inside the bundle the rim of an ear could be seen; making sure what it was, the woman recognized that it was the head of her own daughter. She immediately chased after the girl and just as she was about to catch her, the girl said, "Ogre Mother, it will matter little if you strike me, your house is on fire. [Besides] my horse is fast and you cannot overtake it." The ogress turned to look and saw the red silk fluttering from the window and so turned back. The girl returned to the side of the king. The queen had avenged herself of the evil deeds done her by the ogress and her daughter and she assisted the king to govern his kingdom according to the Law, and their subjects flourished more greatly than ever before.

Frame:

380
When the corpse had finished, The King of Good and Peaceful Deeds said, "If the queen had not killed her own mother in the first place, she could have had a very happy life. Of these two, mother and daughter, the mother became a goddess [*daginis*] and the daughter escaped the jaws of the ogres to become the wife of the king—that was great good fortune." When he said this, [the corpse] cried, "You've spoken to a corpse!" and as sparks flew from the steel net, he struck three times and crying "hur!" was gone from [the prince's] back like a falcon. "I have given myself trouble by not paying attention. If I return [without the corpse], the lama will surely scold me," thought the prince, and so he went off toward the corpses [once again]. Those which cried "ha-la" he struck with his staff and he trod upon those that cried "hulu." Eventually he came to the foot of the tree.

Postscript:

395
Chapter eleven recounting that even though the girl was deceived by the ogress,

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

her mother, being a wise goddess, caused the evil deeds to be repaid and the girl to become the king's wife.

THE TIBETAN AND OTHER FOLKTALES

Without making a thorough study of the motifs and the development of types, any conclusions necessarily remain tentative. The Tibetan story, however, raises interesting issues that have their basis in two conditions: 1) that this version has an early source in Indian Buddhism, which is not at all certain; and 2) that the narrative is well formed and etiologically better grounded than similar stories in other locations, a point which is not without subjective bias. These reservations notwithstanding, the view of the field from this vantage point is, I believe, a worthwhile exercise.

Elements of this story that the corpse tells combines several themes that occur widely in other narrative traditions. Readers familiar with Grimm and Perrault will immediately recognize similarities to "Einäuglein, Zweiäuglein, Dreiäuglein," (One-eye, Two-eyes, and Three-eyes), "Cendrillon," and "The Black and the White Bride." To understand the story as it stands here, it is important to recognize certain social factors that prevailed in Tibet and the basis which Buddhistic beliefs gave to the events. It is with this in mind that comparisons might be drawn to other forms of the narrative as it occurs elsewhere.

To begin with, the matricide in Section I, which is the motivating force for the subsequent episodes of the tale, is found in neither the stories of western Europe nor in those of China. It is best represented in the Middle East and occurs in a few cases in southern Europe. A typical example of a matricide episode is found in a tale called "Stirnmöndlein" from an Iranian collection translated by CHRISTENSEN (1939).[16]

The function of matricide in the Tibetan tale is to involve the girl, blindly obeying the deceitful outsider, in an unforgivable crime, so that the matter of redemption can proceed.[17] Matricide in some southern European stories, the earliest recorded being found in Basile's *Il Pentamerone,*[18] seems to be justified in different ways, often frivolously and not as compellingly as it is in the Middle Eastern stories. In accordance with the didactic nature of the Tibetan story, the girl's enticement and her monstrous acts are designed to show how evil can overwhelm the unwary innocent and bring them to deeds for which they must pay the ultimate price; and in this respect, the more extreme the crime the more effectively it motivates later action. Cosquin has considered the various ways a daughter causes her mother's demise or her transformation into a beast.[19] He concludes, after discussing examples from Asia Minor and southern Europe in which the mother is cannibalized by the two older of, usually, three daughters,[20] that these are "con-

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

tes absurdement défigurés" (COSQUIN 1918, 209), obviously because this worst of crimes appears, as it does in those stories, to be a gratuitous act, leaving the reader wondering what it was that prompted such evil in the first place. In the Tibetan tale, the mother's death is clearly not a disfigurement but instead necessitates the redemption of the girl.

This leads us to the consequences of the matricide. On the surface it appears that because of her evil deed the girl falls into a miserable state from which she needs to be rescued. However, it is her soul that is in jeopardy, the only recompense for her crime being her own death. By contrast, in "Stirnmöndlein,"[21] the Middle Eastern story, the girl, also enticed by a wicked person, is tricked into killing her mother so she could have a doll, but she suffers no real punishment and apparently redeems herself by dealing kindly with a *dev,* an ogress, which she meets when she is chasing after her spinning, which the wind has blown away. With her sins thus easily forgiven, she goes on to be rewarded with great beauty and is married to a prince. The matter of evil shifts in this tale to the lust of the school mistress and seems well adapted to a society in which female adultery excites extraordinary retribution. But more tellingly, the matter of retribution for the girl's crime, done for frivolous reasons, is left unaddressed.

In comparison to the Tibetan and some Middle Eastern versions, the introductory portions of "Cendrillon" and "Einäuglein..." in Europe and the Chinese story in the East are almost vestigial in nature.[22] It is difficult to imagine circumstances in which this important motivating event would have been added to an existing story. It seems more likely that the matricide was deleted in certain cultural settings, which suggests that those stories that retain it are from an older stratum. In these stories where it is expunged, such as the most popular in western Europe and "Yeh-hsien" in China, there appears to be no reason for the girl's plight, except the meanness of the stepmother and stepsisters, who are not ogres of unmitigated evil, but merely nasty people. The outcome of the story turns from retribution for committing a heinous act to justice gained for innocent suffering, which brings the primary focus of the story upon the girl herself.

The European counterpart to Section II is "Einäuglein...."[23] This type is mainly confined to the Slavonic and Baltic areas (ROOTH 1951, 37) but we know it best from the version in Grimm. What was the ogress in the Tibetan tale is instead a woman with three daughters, presumably all of them her own, one with one eye in the middle of her forehead, the second with two eyes as normal people have, and the third with three eyes. They dislike the normal girl and say, "Du mit deinen zwei Augen bist nicht besser als das gemeine Volk, du gehörst nicht zu uns." There is established a framework of loyalties along human versus demonic lines, similar to that in the Tibetan

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

tale, but also along family or clan relationships, in which one does or does not "belong to us."[24] The normal girl, presumably for this reason alone, is ill-treated and poorly fed.

One of her tasks is to herd not a cow but a goat (Aarne-Thompson 510 II a, e). The goat becomes the helping animal but is only an agent of the wise woman who appears and tells the weeping girl how to obtain food from it. When Two-eyes begins to look well-fed, the other daughters are sent to the pasture, one after the other, to discover why. Before Two-eyes commands the goat to serve food, she attempts to sing the spying sisters to sleep. This was easily accomplished with One-eye, but with Three-eyes, she is careless and only sings two of the eyes to sleep so the third stays awake and sees everything. When the mother finds out about the goat, she is angry and kills it. The wise woman appears once again and instructs the girl to ask for the entrails and to bury them before the door.[25]

In the Tibetan tale the tasks of the girl are herding, spinning, and gathering firewood, and the helping animal deals with them all. Rooth points out that in Europe the task of spinning and the obtaining of food rarely occur together in the same story, which presumably has implications regarding the disposition and development of these story types (ROOTH 1951, 156). Nor does the spying motif occur in this section, (ROOTH 1951, 160), yet the major features clearly correspond to the "Einäuglein..." story type up to the point where the helping animal is killed at which the tales diverge.

Section III most clearly corresponds to Grimm's "Aschenputtel" and Perrault's "Cendrillon" (Aarne-Thompson 510 I a, II, III a, IV a, V). The girl's real mother, who has quite a central role in the Tibetan tale, is mentioned in PERRAULT (1977, 79) only in the description of the girl herself: "elle tenait cela (i.e., la douceur et la bonté) de sa Mère, qui était la meilleure personne du monde."

It is worth digressing at this point on mothers, godmothers, and helpful animals. In "Einäuglein..." the wise woman appears but there are no further indications of her character, whether she is human or divine. It is unlikely that she is related in any way to the girl, not even as a fairy godmother, as she is in "Cendrillon." In "Aschenputtel" there is neither reincarnation nor a fairy godmother, though birds generally carry out what one assumes to be the will of the dead mother as she looks down from heaven. It is interesting that in China it is an old man who comforts and advises Yeh-hsien, the Chinese Cinderella. He comes quite literally "down from the sky" (WALEY 1947, 228) as the wise woman does. None of these cases provides the narrative focus that the mother's self-sacrifice does in the Tibetan tale.

In "Cendrillon" we saw that the girl's helper is "sa Marraine, qui était Fée." Godmothers are by definition a proxy, an ecclesiastical functionary by

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

which certain rites like baptism and confirmation are expedited. Only godmothers can do certain things, an observation made by PERRAULT (1977, 81, 90) that he adds, almost as an afterthought, at the end of the story. In contrast to the anonymity of the "marraine," or godmother, of the European versions, in Tibet and Mongolia the wise goddess (Mongolian: *belge bilig dagini;* Tibetan: *ye-she kyi mkha'-'gro-ma;* Skt. *jñana dakini*) is in fact the mother who achieved this status through consenting to be reborn in a lower form of life expressly to help her daughter who was the very agent of her death. The girl, on the other hand, is not even named, and her marriage to the king, which in the West is the much anticipated climax, is seen in this narrative only as one event among others and is, more significantly, owing not to her own qualities but to the efforts of her mother.

There are European versions in which the helping animal will be a cow or a sheep. A fish has this function in the Chinese and the Southeast Asian versions, though it does occur as well in Arabic tales (WALEY 1947, 227–29, 231; BUSHNAQ 1986, 82). The choice of a helping animal tells us something about the culture, though it is hard to say exactly what. For most it is difficult to see kindness in a fish, but domesticated animals are easily endowed with the better human qualities. In the Tibetan story, besides the cow that is chosen in the episode of the girl's direst need, there are also birds, usually of the smaller and more beautiful variety, and finally the horse who, breaking away from the herd while being watered, finds the slipper and later, itself filled with compassion, leads the herdsman to the lake where the mistress was drowned. The horse is no reincarnation as the cow and the birds likely were, but an animal imbued with a sensitivity beyond human comprehension.

The merging of the dead mother with the helpful animal is a complication for most folklorists and has been the subject of considerable discussion and puzzlement. COSQUIN devotes part of an excursus to it (1918, 202–208) in which he examines various developments of the helper theme: (1) an animal which is bequeathed by a dying mother; (2) the dead mother who emerges from her grave as herself, as an angel, or as a bird; (3) the mother who remains in her grave but offers advice to the girl, usually to seek help of a certain animal; or (4) the mother who disappears from the tale altogether and an animal helps the girl quite spontaneously. Of this last he says that the function of the animal in the story can be explained only "par un obscurcissement du sous-thème" (COSQUIN 1918, 204). This is an interesting conclusion, which leads us to consider once again why the "sub-theme" might have ceased to function in the first place.

There are interesting similarities between the Tibetan treatment of the mother and that in a Persian story where it is stated explicitly that "Little

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Fatima's own mother turns into a yellow cow and comes out of the vinegar jar"[26] to help her daughter by producing needed things from her horns. The bones of Yeh-hsien's fish in the Chinese story provide for all her wishes, though there is no suggestion that the fish is related to Yeh-hsien's mother. In some traditions there may be a vague relationship between the mother's reincarnation as an animal and stories in which the mother becomes an animal through some accident, as in the Kashmiri story, "The Wicked Stepmother," among others.[27] The final step in the development of this motif has the mother as an animal from the very start. We see this in the variant tale collected in Inverness before 1886 in which the heroine is the result of carnal union between the king and a sheep.[28]

Clearly the latter incidents are far removed from what we find elsewhere in the tradition, and Neil PHILIP is undoubtedly right to suggest "the idea that the mother is actually a ewe is ... a result of narrative degeneration...." (1989, 58). However, he says as well that "it is very rare for Cinderella stories to depict the helpful animal as the physical mother," and ROOTH feels that "...the dead mother is irrelevant for the evolution of the events and the mentioning of the dead mother may be omitted" (1951, 154). It seems, however, that a considerable branch of the tradition, which goes from Central Asia to Morocco, does make use of the mother's death. And in light of Rooth's remark that chimerical tales are logically organized and that "in determining the original forms of the tale and the place of origin, this logical element in composition is the most important criterion" (ROOTH 1951, 26), we would be inclined to conclude that the transmigration of souls in a Buddhist community provides the logic for the existence of the helping animal extraordinarily well.[29]

Regarding transmigration of souls, TING Nai-tung says that "The motif of mother-as-cow could not have thrived in ancient China because it runs counter to the Chinese Buddhist concept of Karma. According to this concept, a person who had led a good life should continue to be human and become happy and prosperous in his next existence.... A Chinese girl would therefore be profoundly disturbed to learn that her mother had assumed such a humble form, even though with the purpose of helping herself" (1974, 36–37). It is true that this motif is not typical of Chinese thinking in general, but even in China a Buddhist will recognize the intense devotion and great good in an individual who will, in the manner of a bodhisattva, consent to be reborn in a lower form to help save creatures who have not transcended samsara, the cycle of life and death. Certainly the mother's assumption of "such a humble form" is profoundly disturbing, but this more Confucian than Buddhist view is not likely to have dominated the interpretation in Tibet or Mongolia, where it was not the girl's feelings that are

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

important but rather the need for the mother to save the soul of her daughter who had committed matricide, the worst of all sins. Here again, if the exemplars Ting considered most basic to the Chinese tradition lacked the introductory episode, it would be difficult to see why the mother would suffer another incarnation merely to help an innocent in dire straights, because the soul of an innocent is secure. So it would appear that those tales in which the matricide was omitted, or more significantly, in which it was retained but failed to motivate attempts to save the daughter's soul, have indeed lost some aspect of their original development.

Neil PHILIP sees the festival as providing the meeting place for the girl and her future husband and this he feels is a "European development" (1989, 5). Like the Tibetan version, there is in fact an Indian version[30] which has this feature, and though one might argue that it could have been reintroduced from English sources, there is little likelihood of such influence in the Tibetan story where the festival functions in this way as well.

In the narrative traditions that retain it, the matter of the shoe is perhaps one of the features that tries the ingenuity of local storytellers most, especially in those cultures where shoes are not generally worn. It is as well a feature by which one might determine whether the story is a cultural import, though this is a complex question. WALEY suggests that a shoe would, among the shoeless, make "the story additionally impressive" (1947, 231). COX says that the shoe incident is "the most salient feature of Cinderella proper" and probably dated from before the twelfth century (1893, xl). One would expect this feature to become "most salient" in a tradition where the moral underpinnings of this didactic tale had been lost as it migrated to new regions. Certainly in the Tibetan story it cannot be anything but a secondary feature hardly as important as the events surrounding the death and transfiguration of the mother or indeed the death and resurrection of the girl. The search here for the owner of the shoe has suspense but it is not protracted and seems almost matter of fact by comparison. Such cursory treatment of an "important" event might reflect a more primitive style of narrative but in fact it shows that the authors of the Tibetan tale were concerned with other things, namely how the crime of the girl is to be repaid.

The typical European Cinderella story ends with the wedding. As we have seen, this is not the case in the Tibetan tale,[31] which continues into a final episode. Section IV corresponds to the latter parts of a story type called "The Black and the White Bride" (Aarne-Thompson 403 IV c). What concerns us primarily in the European tales is the motif of bride substitution in which the heroine, soon after her marriage to the king, is deposed by the stepmother or the stepsister by being thrown into water, down a well, or over the side of a boat. The stepsister takes her place, undetected by the king and

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

his court. At some point the heroine is transformed into an animal, but eventually is discovered, disenchanted and is reinstated in her rightful place, and the stepsister and stepmother are punished.

Again, comparison suggests that the European versions of this part of the tale are random as well. It is easy to see how a non-Buddhist storyteller will have difficulty understanding the syntax of events in a story like the Tibetan tale; it is reasonable to expect that the episodes will come apart and be used separately when the doctrines creating the cohesion among them are absent. The notions of transmigration available to the Iranian and European, for example, will not sustain the chain of events that consists of (1) the vulnerable heroine being preyed upon by an evil influence, (2) the committing of the heinous crime of killing her own mother (a crime for which only death is the fitting punishment, and indeed letting her suffer the punishment), and (3) the reviving of the heroine with a soul redeemed. We find that in the Iranian and certain European tales, the girl's expiation is assumed without any real retribution, and the reward is not based on a test of moral character. If the death and transfiguration motif does appear in tales outside the influence of Buddhist thought, it takes on the character of a chance occurrence in the narrative as it remains unhinged from the moral system of the community.

Finally, this raises the matter of evil and the role it plays, or fails to play, in justifying events in this cycle of stories. We see in the Tibetan story the influences of Buddhism and its antecedents which concentrate evil in the ogres, the non-human creatures that are the enemies of religion and all mankind. When we compare this tale to its counterparts both in the West and in China, however, we find instead that a nameless and arbitrary fate functions behind the events. We saw in "Stirnmöndlein" that evil had become randomized, a schoolmistress ruthlessly pursuing her own aims. Similarly, in other stories the unmitigated, indeed often burlesque, evil of stepmothers and stepsisters, or of daughters cannibalizing their own mother, seem equally fortuitous. The most striking feature of these versions is the easy acceptance of the horrendous and senseless crimes that are usually the result of unreasonable and bizarre proscriptions or are done for frivolous and unaccountable reasons. As such they suggest stories that are indeed disengaged from a consistent moral system that was, at an earlier stage, basic to their development and, through dislocation, had suffered the adumbration of sub-themes and became the absurdly disfigured tales of which Cosquin spoke. It is this that gives the events in these tales their "fanciful" nature. This is not to say that the Tibetan tale is not fanciful but rather that its unusual events have a clearly reasoned cause for their existence. In the European tales the fanciful nature of events is accepted on the grounds that

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

such things occur in "mere stories." It is interesting to speculate that an attitude such as this, fostered by "contes défigurés" might determine to a considerable extent the boundaries of literary realism in cultures where it is commonplace.

Conclusions

In Macdonald's view this collection dates from Indian Buddhist times and was brought by Atiša in 1042 AD to Tibet. It will be from a stratum older than the Indian versions existing now, whose differences, he contends, arose from Hindu and Jain efforts to obliterate the traces of Buddhism (1967, 16–17). Consequently, it will have been in Tibet where, like so many other aspects of the Indian Buddhist tradition, the story in this form will have been preserved. If we accept Macdonald's speculations, it would put this version rather earlier than the first accounts of tales in Europe or the Middle East at a similar stage in development and suggest that its antecedents could even predate the Chinese story of "Yeh-hsien." It is tempting then to see the Tibetan tale and both eastern and western branches of the Cinderella cycle as sharing a common ancestor in the early sources of Buddhist India.

The Tibetan tale is a well-formed didactic tale founded upon the Buddhist moral world, which provides logical grounds for its most important parts: the matricide, the animal helper, the function of evil and the fall from grace, rehabilitation and final salvation. Its comparatively sounder etiological grounding suggests that certain tales elsewhere exhibit signs of "literalizing," i.e., taking elements at face-value despite the fact that there is little moral or logical justification for them in the prevailing "real world" of the local community. This seems to be most obvious in such events as gratuitous matricide or cannibalism, or help from a divine being appearing out of nowhere, the like of which one can only conclude are literalized elements.[32]

If we assume that, as it migrates from one community to another, the tale will encounter different moral systems upon which its interpretation will depend, it follows that certain elements will lose the social context which gave them meaning; thus there will quite naturally be a shift of focus in the resulting narratives, and fate, which is eminently manageable by story tellers, will inevitably begin to function as the motivating force. In such circumstances it is interesting to see how, for example, the gift of beauty in some traditions like the Chinese is hardly noticed, while in others it is merely one element among the rest, and in still others becomes the primary message so that a figure lacking all else can become the very ideal of popular culture, as it does in certain modern developments of Cinderella.[33]

Finally, it is to be remarked that both mundane as well as spiritual salvation are found among all versions. In the Tibetan story there is a spiritual

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

salvation, which is merely to say that the physical events are set in the context of a carefully evolved cosmology and given value by the local religious system, the result being a consistently rationalized narrative. When the episodes are taken as separate stories, the marriage to the prince is always invoked as the solution to the heroine's plight, suggesting once again "un obscurcissement du sous-thème," but one resulting in mundane salvation.

List of Motifs

The motifs that fall into the classification of Aarne-Thompson are so marked. A letter followed by a number (e.g., L52, B313.1) designates a submotif according to Aarne and Thompson (1961). Comments with square brackets are close but not exact descriptions of events in the Tibetan story. Sometimes these are put into clusters when that is more descriptive. They are divided into the four major sections of the Tibetan tale.

I. (no Aarne-Thompson classification)
- —initial unstable situation; proximity to dwelling of ogres
- —ogres entice girl
- —death of girl's mother (a crucial motivating factor in plot development; this element appears in many other versions but usually in vestigial form that is gratuitous and lacking efficacy)

II. (Aarne-Thompson 511)
- —cruel guardian-seductress [S31. cruel stepmother]
- —girl mistreated [L55. stepdaughter heroine; L52. abused youngest daughter]
- —E323.2. dead mother returns to aid persecuted daughter; B313.1 helpful animal reincarnation of parent; dead mother appears to heroine in the form of an animal; E611.2. (mother) reincarnated as cow
- —B335. helpful animal killed by enemy of heroine
- —parts of helpful animal are preserved by heroine

III. (Aarne-Thompson 510)
- —heroine's task performed by helpful animal; E323.2. dead mother returns to aid persecuted daughter; mother reincarnated as bird
- —parts of helpful animal are transformed into clothing and jewels
- —N711.6. prince (king) sees heroine at festival and is enamored
- —heroine cautioned to return before ogress; [C761.3. taboo: staying at ball beyond a certain hour]
- —heroine discovered on second night; [R221. heroine's three-fold flight from ball]
- —H36.1. identification through slipper test; [F823.2. glass slippers]

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

—L162. lowly heroine marries prince (king)
—heroine delivered from her tormenters

IV. (Aarne-Thompson 403)
—visit by ogress's daughter [K2212.2. treacherous stepsister]
—false information to ogress's daughter
—tricking and drowning of heroine [S432. cast-off wife thrown into water]
—K1911. the false bride (substituted bride) [K1911.1.2. false bride takes true bride's place when child is born]
—heroine found by king's horse and appears as bird to king's men [D683.2. transformation by witch (sorceress)]
—death of substitute bride and heroine's life is restored [D762. disenchantment by proper person waking from magic sleep]
—heroine redeemed and justice prevails

NOTES

1. See MACDONALD (1967 and 1972), and DAMDINSÜRÜNG (1962 and 1964). There are some differences in the Tibetan texts as well as in the interpretations of Macdonald and the Mongolian translators; I shall not deal with these exhaustively but only remark on those that have some bearing on the narrative.

2. The eleventh tale does not occur in the other collections of the magic corpse stories, including such editions as the Mongolian *Siditü ḳegür-ün üliger* of the 1928 Ulan Bator printing (*Magic Corpse* 1957), or translations by Bernard JÜLG (1973) or David MACDONALD (1931, 178–92, 294–315) or J. R. KRUEGER (1978). It is noteworthy as well that the Tibetan stories that Ting Nai-tung discusses in his work differ from this present version quite considerably, and likely belong to a different textual tradition (TING 1974, esp. chapters 9–11 and pp. 5–6, 15–18, 47–53).

3. The following translation is based on the Mongolian version (DAMDINSÜRÜNG 1964, 334–48). Numbers at the head of certain paragraphs refer to the appropriate line in Damdinsürüng's Mongolian text. The division into Sections I–IV is to facilitate the later discussion. Comments of a textual nature arising from the two versions in Tibetan are added where necessary. Issues concerning the structure of the narrative or its relationship to tales in other traditions are taken up in the discussion following the translation.

4. MACDONALD translates this "des morceaux d'oreilles humaines qu'elles firent cuire comme des navets grillés. La fille dit: 'Les navets grillés ont bon goût.'" (1967, 173). The Damdinsürüng Tibetan text (DAMDINSÜRÜNG 1964, 335) has *nyung* in both instances but the Mongolian translators chose to read it as *nyung-ba* ("a little bit"); Macdonald must have read it as *nyung-ma* ("turnip"), though the word occurs in his text only in the girl's remark.

5. Or to "knead the flour." There is some difficulty with this detail and the Tibetan texts differ; in MACDONALD (1967, 173) we have *a-ma'i nu-mas lto phye chags-na:* "...si ma mère pétrit (les graines en) farine avec ses seins...." In the DAMDINSÜRÜNG edition (1964, 335) it is *a-ma'i nu-ma rdo-ches chags-na* in which there seems to be neither mention of flour nor of kneading it. Although the Tibetan sentence is not perfectly clear to me, the Mongolian translation is definite: *eḳe-yin ḳökö-ber čilaγu-yi čoḳibasu... "...if mother will beat the stone with her*

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

breasts..."—the same phrase being used two other times in the text. Macdonald claims that kneading grain with the breasts is a method characteristic of the poorer regions of Tibet, and in this connection he points out that it recalls accounts of *ma-mo* (demons), old women whose breasts are so long they can be thrown over their shoulders (MACDONALD 1967, 173, and n. 4). Indeed, in an Iraqi story there is an ogress (*s'iluwa*) who has breasts this long, which seem to get in her way while she is grinding flour (STEVENS 1931, see xv-xvi and story 36 "The Poor Girl and her Cow," 186–93). The heroine happens upon her and surreptitiously sucks from these breasts and when the ogress discovers her, she is better disposed toward her and decides not to eat her up. None of this develops in the Tibetan tale.

6. There seems to be no case in the Cinderella tradition of a grinding task as opposed to the separating task at this point in the narrative. The Tibetan texts agree with one another; MACDONALD's translation (1967, 177) "Si tu ne termines pas aujourd'hui de partager cela..." (*de-ring 'di phye tsar ma-byung-na...*) speaks of separating the mustard seeds from the barley; the Mongolian translation (DAMDINSÜRÜNG 1964, 338) "*ökin či egün-i ene edür nüdüǰü ese güičedkebesü...*" (*mo la 'di de-ring phye tsar-ba ma-byung-na...*) refers to grinding (*nüdüǰü*) and is probably in error, reading *phye* as "flour" instead of as a form of *byed-pa,* "to separate" (JÄSCHKE 1972, 398). In Grimm's "Aschenputtel" separating lentils from the ashes becomes a test, a false one as it turns out, of the girl's worthiness to go to the ball (GRIMM and GRIMM 1974, 95). The detail does not occur in Perrault.

7. The term is *phug-ron (phu-ron),* which is translated as "pigeon" in DAMDINSÜRÜNG (1964, 338); *pho-rog,* "raven" in MACDONALD (1967, 177).

8. The two Tibetan texts differ in the matter of the boots. MACDONALD's text at this point (1967, 177) is faulty and says first that the four feet were transformed into boots (*sug-po bzhi-po lham-du song*) and later that the four feet were transformed into felt shoes (*sug-po bzhi-po zom-par song;* for *zom-par* see *zon-pa:* "stuff" [or "woolen-shoes"] JÄSCHKE 1972, 490). In the DAMDINSÜRÜNG text (1964, 339) the number "two" (*gnyis*) instead of "four" (*bzhi*) occurs in both places, and in the second instance it says quite specifically "the other two (*gzhan gnyis*) hooves became felt shoes" (*sug-po gzhan gnyis zom-par song*), and it keeps the distinction quite clearly between boots, *lham,* and slippers (*zom-pa*), for the rest of the episode. Macdonald translates the term *zom-pa* variously, once as "souliers" but usually as "bottes," the latter being the same word he uses to translate *lham.* Having two pairs of footgear introduces certain intricacies to the narrative. Apparently, on the trip to the festival the girl wore her boots and she carried the felt shoes with her to put on after she arrived. It was this more elegant footwear that was discovered later by the king's men.

It is a curious coincidence that both in English and Mongolian there is a problem with the term for slippers. The "glass slipper" of the English Cinderella is said to be a mistranslation of "pantoufle de vair" and that "verre" (glass) was inadvertently substituted for "vair," a rarer word referring to a kind of vole, the skin of which can be used for making delicate slippers (RALSTON 1879, 837 and 853; and COX 1893, 506; also FOLEY 1954, 412–15, esp. 414). In Tibetan, it will be remembered, "slipper" was designated by the word *zon-pa.* However, *zon-pa* is often spelled *zom-pa,* and that form also refers to a container such as a bucket (DAS 1981, 1098). The Mongolian translators render *zom-pa* as *saγulaγ-a* (bucket, container), and it is interesting that nowhere except in this translation does *saγulaγ-a* ever seem to indicate any form of footwear (*Mongolian-Chinese Dictionary* 1976, 856). We shall see that *saγulaγ-a* occurs in the sense of a container elsewhere in this story where it translates *bre* which usually means "two pints" (JÄSCHKE 1972, 381, says 4 pints); see note 10 below. A more likely term for shoe in Mongolian would be *šaqai* or *könggen šaqai.*

9. The term in DAMDINSÜRÜNG (1964, 339) is *ngan-pa* (error for *ngang-pa*) *gser-ldan,* in which *ngang-pa* is "light bay" (JÄSCHKE 1972, 126) and *gser-ldan* seems to mean "golden

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

cheeks" (see JÄSCHKE 1972, 289, for *ldan*). The Mongolians translate this into *qula sirγ-a ḳülüg;* in which *qula* refers to the gold color of some horses and *sirγ-a* to a tawny colored horse with a glossy mane; *ḳülüg* is a fine horse (*Mongolian-Chinese Dictionary* 1976, 674, 702, 922). In Tibet many horses are named in this way (MACDONALD 1967, 179, n. 2), but since the Mongolians preferred to translate the terms, I have reflected this in the English translation. In other traditions, finding the shoe frequently involves the king's horses. In the Arabic story "The Little Red Fish and the Clog of Gold," the horse finds the shoe (BUSHNAQ 1986, 84). In the Jewish-Moroccan Cinderella tales the shoe is found in the place where the king's horses drink. See BAR-ITZHAK 1993 (93–125, esp. 109–10), where it is also remarked that in sources as early as Strabo is found the motif in which someone falls in love with the unseen owner of a beautiful shoe, similar to the case in China where the search is for someone not known or seen before (WALEY 1947, 228–29). The Tibetan and other stories differ since the prince has already seen the woman with whom he falls in love and the shoe becomes merely the means by which to find her again.

10. The measure *bre* is here translated by the Mongolians as *saγulaγ-a,* ("bucket"); see note 8.

11. In other words, *gzhon-nu don-grub.*

12. Both Tibetan texts have *ḳhyi ngang dḳar dung chung,* "the dogs Ngang-dkar and Dungchung" in which both words appear to be names of dogs as Macdonald treats them. Although *ngang dḳar* is translated literally as "white goose" by the Mongolians, I have chosen to transliterate it from the Tibetan as a proper name. See MACDONALD (1967, 183, n. 4) and DAS (1981, 568).

13. The result of this is seen below: "She put a solid knot of thread in the embers and so everyday she had to go out to beg someone for fire." See MACDONALD (1967, 183, n. 6).

14. The Mongolian is *ökin minu buruγu boluluγ-a.* There is no reason to believe that the bird at this point is the reincarnation of the mother since it speaks with the voice of the girl in the very next lines. The Tibetan says, "It is the girl's own wrong" (*bu-mo rang-gyi nyes-pa yin*). The sense seems to be "I, this girl, have committed a wrong, but let me, the bird, go." See DAMDINSÜRÜNG (1964, 345).

15. In other words, the ceremony to secure happiness and prosperity and the ceremony to assure fulfillment of one's years. See DAMDINSÜRÜNG (1964, 345) and MACDONALD (1967, 187, n. 3).

16. The tale is about a girl who is blessed with a shining moon on her brow and a star on her chin. It tells how she is deluded by an evil school mistress who wants to marry her father. The school mistress makes dolls for all the children in the school except for her; when the girl asks why she was given no doll, the school mistress says that only if she kills her mother will she get one like the others. The school mistress then instructs her to drown her mother in a butt of vinegar, which she does (CHRISTENSEN 1939, 90–96). See also "Little Fatima," no. 13 in LORIMER and LORIMER (1919, 79–93), which is quite similar to "Stirnmöndlein." The Jewish-Moroccan Cinderella tales also make use of the matricide and otherwise parallel quite closely the Tibetan tale (BAR-ITZHAK 1993, 93–125).

17. BAR-ITZHAK remarks in this regard that "women can only be saved and redeemed when a male figure steps in.... Women in this tale act because they realize that men must be made to act, and because it is men, and only men, who can save and redeem them" (1993, 116). This is obviously an important structural feature of the tale in its Middle Eastern social context. In the Tibetan tale, however, male involvement is conspicuous by its absence. One is tempted to speculate that this is owing to certain aspects of nomadic and herding life where women are left alone for long periods of time and through necessity act more often independently of men. If this is true, it could suggest a point at which the Tibetan tale might pos-

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

sibly differ from its Indian source. On the other hand, the circumstances are quite possible in any culture in which the male and female worlds are strictly separated for other reasons.

18. First published between 1632 and 1634. The story in question is "The Cat Cinderella," reprinted in DUNDES (1988, 3–13).

19. See ROOTH (1951, 218) for the mother's being transformed into a sheep; also see page 202 where she refers to tales of the Near East in which the girl is persuaded to kill her mother, and page 214 for stories of the Balkans in which the girl causes her mother's death by the inadvertent act of dropping her spindle. In VILGRAIN (1984) is a discussion of this aspect of the Tibetan tale, but I have not been able to find the work. See also "How Fatima killed her Mother and what came of it," no. 39 and "Little Fatima," no. 13 in LORIMER and LORIMER (1919, 256–68).

20. See a special study of this in XANTHAKOU (1988).

21. ROOTH (1951), Type AB; see note 16 above.

22. In this regard the Chinese story "Yeh-hsien" parallels those of western Europe. It is the oldest known written story in the Cinderella cycle. It was recorded by Tuan Ch'eng-shih (800–863 AD) in his book *Yu-yang Tsa-tsu*. See TING (1974, 5), and WALEY (1947, 227–29). There are other Chinese versions, some of which may retain the matricide (see, for example, ROOTH 1951, 194–96), just as some tales from northern Europe and Scotland do.

23. This is type 511 in AARNE and THOMPSON (1961). Hereafter folktale types are noted as "Aarne-Thompson" plus the type number.

24. In the Jewish-Moroccan tales it is along blood lines (see BAR-ITZHAK 1993, 116).

25. There is an interesting variant to this in Baltic and West Slavonic versions that has the girl getting the four feet but being required to put them at the four corners of the room or the house (ROOTH 1951, 39, 44). We will recall that in the Tibetan tale all four feet have an important, practical function in the narrative.

26. See no. 13 "Little Fatima," in LORIMER and LORIMER (1919, 80). ROOTH (1951, 147) speculates that this story type "must, in the Near East, be at least 4,000 years old." It is interesting to see that the Tibetan and Persian stories more closely resemble one another than the Persian does its supposed early antecedent, which still leaves open the question of which way the influences travelled.

27. See KNOWLES 1888, 127. In this case a Brahman insists his wife should never eat anything unless he is present, otherwise she should surely become a goat. She inadvertently breaks the rule when she tastes some food while feeding the children.

28. See COX 1893, 534–35. See also the story "Ashey Pelt" as recorded in DAMANT (1895; reprinted in PHILIP 1989, 58–59).

29. Interestingly enough ROOTH allows that the regeneration of the mother into one or another form of existence "is something that developed in the Oriental tradition..." and, if I read her correctly, a genetic connection between this type of Eastern tale with the European tale exists principally because of that motif (1951, 155).

30. See COX 1893, 183, no. 24. (This text by Cox was published as early as 1864.)

31. It is also not the final episode in the Jewish-Moroccan tales (cf. BAR-ITZHAK 1993, 106).

32. "Literalizing" also provides a wider context against which to judge certain notions. For example, some psychologists suggest that cannibalism occurs in some of the tales because it serves as a means by which children might get retribution against adults who tend to devour them emotionally, a conclusion which is clearly the result of a piece-meal approach with suspiciously strong overtones of modern after-the-fact analysis taken to extremes.

33. The issues here have been raised at times before and are discussed briefly by Joseph Campbell in "Folkloristic Commentary" appended to HUNT (1974, 833–64).

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

REFERENCES CITED

AARNE, Antti and Stith THOMPSON
1961 *The types of the folktale: A classification and bibliography.* FF Communications, no. 184. Helsinki: Academia Scientiarum Fennica.

BAR-ITZHAK, Haya
1993 "Smeda Rmeda who destroys her luck with her own hands": A Jewish Moroccan Cinderella tale in an Israeli context. *Journal of Folklore Research* 30 (2-3): 93–125.

BUSHNAQ, Inea
1986 *Arab Folk-tales.* Cairo: The American University in Cairo Press.

CHRISTENSEN, Arthur, translator
1939 *Märchen aus Iran.* Jena: Eugen Diederichs Verlag.

COSQUIN, Emmanuel
1918 Cendrillon sur la tombe de sa mère. *Revue des Traditions Populaires* 33(8-9): 202–208.

COX, Marian Roalfe
1893 *Cinderella.* London: Folk-Lore Society.

DAMANT, M.
1895 Folk Tales. *Folk-Lore* 6. London: The Folk-Lore Society. (Reprinted in PHILIP 1989, 58–59.)

DAMDINSÜRÜNG, C., editor
1962 *Töbed mongγol siditü kegür-ün üliger,* Part. I. Corpus Scriptorum Mongolorum, tomus II. Ulan Bator: Science Academy Press.
1964 *Töbed mongγol siditü kegür-ün üliger,* Part. II. Corpus Scriptorum Mongolorum, tomus II. Ulan Bator: Science Academy Press.

DAS, Chandras
1981 *Tibetan-English dictionary.* Calcutta: Bengal Secretariat Book Depôt. (1902 reprint. Kyoto: Rinsen Book Company.)

DUNDES, Alan
1988 *Cinderella: A casebook.* Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.

FOLEY, Lewis
1954 A princess and her magic footwear. *The Modern Language Journal* 38: 412–15.

GRIMM, Jacob and Wilhelm GRIMM
1974 *Die Märchen der Brüder Grimm.* From the unabridged version of 1857. Munich: Wilhelm Goldmann.

HUNT, Margaret, translator
1974 *The complete Grimm's fairy tales.* Revised by James Stern. New York: Random House.

JÄSCHKE, H. A.
1972 *A Tibetan-English dictionary.* London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd. (1881 reprint.)

JÜLG, Bernard
1973 *Mongolische Märchen-Sammlung.* Innsbruck: Verlag der Wagner'schen Universitäts Buchhandlung. (1868 reprint. Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlag.)

KNOWLES, John Hinton
1888 *Folk-tales of Kashmir.* London: Trübner & Co.

KRUEGER, J. R., editor
1978 *Thirteen Kalmyk-Oirat tales from the bewitched corpse cycle.* Bloomington: The Mongolia Society.

LORIMER, D. L. R. and E. O. LORIMER, translators
1919 *Persian tales.* London: Macmillan.

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

MACDONALD, Alexander W.
1967 *Matériaux pour l'étude de la littérature populaire Tibétaine,* tome I. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France. (1990 reprint.)
1972 *Matériaux pour l'étude de la littérature populaire Tibétaine,* tome II. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
MACDONALD, David
1931 Tibetan tales. *Folk-Lore* 42: 178–92, 294–315, 447–64.
Magic Corpse
1957 *Siditü kegür-ün üliger* [Story of the magic corpse]. Ulan Bator: People's Press of Inner Mongolia. (1928 reprint. Kökeqota: Öber Mongγul-un arad-un keble-ün qoriy-a.)
Mongolian-Chinese Dictionary
1976 *Mongγul kitad toli* [Mongolian-Chinese dictionary]. Edited by the Mongolian Language Research Group of the University of Inner Mongolia. Kökeqota: Peoples Press of Inner Mongolia.
PERRAULT, Charles
1977 *Contes de ma mère l'Oye.* Paris: Gallimard.
PHILIP, Neil, editor
1989 *The Cinderella story.* London: Penguin Books.
RALSTON, W. R. S.
1879 Cinderella. *The nineteenth century: A monthly review* 6 (July–December): 837–53.
ROOTH, Anna Birgitta
1951 *The Cinderella cycle.* Lund: Gleerup.
STEVENS, E. S., translator
1931 *Folk-Tales of 'Iraq.* London: Oxford University Press.
TING, Nai-tung
1974 *The Cinderella cycle in China and Indo-china.* FF Communications, no. 213. Helsinki: Academia Scientiarum Fennica.
VILGRAIN, Bénédict
1984 *Où l'on apprend que Cendrillon a tué sa mère.* Neuilly sur Seine: Théâtre Typographique.
WALEY, Arthur
1947 The Chinese Cinderella story. *Folk-Lore* 58: 226–38.
XANTHAKOU, Margarita
1988 Cendrillon et les soeurs cannibales. *Cahiers de l'Homme,* NS xxviii. Paris: Éditions de l'École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales.

This content downloaded from 194.214.27.178 on Mon, 5 Aug 2013 08:31:50 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions